HENRY STEPHEN CUTLER: PIONEER OF THE AMERICAN BOY CHOIR

FALK SEMINAR 1994

Connie Baker
HENRY STEPHEN CUTLER: PIONEER OF THE AMERICAN BOY CHOIR

The name Henry Stephen Cutler (1824-1902) is most likely to emerge as identifying the organist and choirmaster at Trinity Church in New York. This highly trained musician was a prime-mover in America's response to the Oxford movement, and the organizer of the first all-male surpliced choir in the United States. All these outstanding achievements by Cutler ranked him a noteworthy member of the musical society of his time. But, additionally, Cutler was a zealous and versatile individual whose career lasted from the late 1840s until 1885 when he retired.\footnote{W.S.B. Mathews, \textit{A Hundred Years of Music In America}, (New York: AMS Press Inc.; 1970), 270.} A photograph of the retired Cutler is shown here as Figure One.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.8\textwidth]{cutler.png}
\caption{Henry Stephen Cutler (1824-1902)}
\end{figure}
During this career Cutler composed church music. Various works by Cutler can be found in different collections, but large portion of his music remains unpublished. His music reflects his devotion for the "ancient and pure school of ecclesiastical music" and his ability as a composer.²

Cutler was born in Boston. He developed a talent for music early in life. According to his only biographer, W.S.B. Mathews, Cutler was instructed by several teachers including George F. Root.³ In 1844 Cutler was sent to study in Germany. While abroad he also spent some time in England where he became interested in English cathedral music. After visiting a number of these cathedrals and becoming familiar with the method of worship, Cutler was inspired to implant the English style of music and male singing in the United States when he returned.⁴

Cutler returned to the United States in 1846 and continued his musical studies. He was listed as a convention attendee in the


³Mathews, *A Hundred Years of Music in America*, 270. A letter from Jacklin Stopp, dated June 1, 1994 casts doubts on Root’s tutelage recognizing instead that Cutler probably studied only under Root’s associate, A.N. Johnson. The absence of any mention of Cutler from Root’s own account helps to support this doubt. See George F. Root, *The Story of a Musical Life*, (Cincinnati: The John Church Company; 1891). It is not unusual to find biographers who trusted interviewees and publishers who stood only to gain by promotion of alleged training under someone with an established reputation.

⁴Mathews, *A Hundred Years of Music in America*, 270.
Catalogue of the Convention of Teachers Assembled in Boston in 1846. His first professional post was at Grace Church in Boston where he played organ also in 1846. It was at this position that Cutler became associated with Artemus Nixon Johnson, who is believed to have been another of his teachers. In 1852 Johnson compiled and published two collections of music. One was entitled *American Church Organ Voluntaries* and the other was a fantastically varied assortment of material grouped under the title *Melodia Sacra: a Complete Collection of Church Music: to which is added a Full and Complete Elementary Singing School Course. An Easy Arrangement of [Sigismond] Neukomm’s Celebrated Oratorio of David. A Choice Collection of Interludes. By George F. Bristow, and an Episcopal Service by H.S. Cutler*. Cutler contributed to both of these publications.

Cutler did not work long at Grace Church because he tried to establish two choirs of men and boys on either side of the chancel as in England and the wardens and vestry of Grace Church were opposed to this idea. As a reported result Cutler accepted a

---


7Stopp, *American Church Organ Voluntaries*, ii. (Cutler’s association with Johnson also confirmed in a letter from Stopp in footnote three).

8The Parish of the Advent in the City of Boston: A History of One Hundred Years 1844-1944, (Boston: Printed for the Parish of the Advent, 1944.), 42. A feature of choral worship in the English cathedrals was the division of choir into two sections each designated as decani and cantoris from their seats on the side of
the Dean and the Precentor respectively. This arrangement facilitated antiphonal or responsive chanting and was often featured in the more elaborate settings of anthems and Service music. See Figure two.

9 The Parish of the Advent, 42.

10 Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 270.

11 The Parish of the Advent, 42.
position at the Church of the Advent in the same city as organist and choirmaster. He accomplished this move in 1854. The Church of the Advent was struggling to form a dependable choir in a more "churchly arrangement". The rector, the Reverend Horatio Southgate, was a primary motivator in the movement to establish boy choirs, because of his partiality to the training of children for choir. He thought it necessary to have two choirs of men and boys to sing on either side of the chancel. Some members of the Advent church were opposed to these changes and expressed their reluctance. However, Southgate did make the changes when he hired Cutler.

Cutler, already familiar with this procedure, seized the opportunity to fulfill his ambition of implanting an English practice in the United States. Cutler brought six boys with him to Advent and as reported by the Parish historian after his employment Advent's music became at once a subject of much interest to Boston's musical sector of the time, especially as it was developed along the lines of the so-called English cathedral service. This suggests that Cutler was composing music while there, However, unfortunately, as stated before, not all of Cutler's work's were

---

9 The Parish of the Advent, 42.
10 Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 270.
11 The Parish of the Advent, 42.
12 Rasmussen, Musical Taste, 353.
13 The Parish of the Advent, 42.
14 The Parish of the Advent, 42, 126.
published, and titles of music performed at Advent cannot be found in the church's recorded history. His choir did, however, have the distinction of becoming the first all male surpliced choir in America during his tenure at Advent. This action by Cutler was at the time considered "popish" and was criticized by many even leading one Bishop in Massachusetts to boycott Advent church for eleven years. This prejudice did not hinder Cutler, and his innovations changed the practices of choirs in the Episcopal church permanently. After Cutler, there is no mention of another choirmaster in Advent's recorded history for fourteen years. 

In 1858 Cutler, while still employed at the Church of the Advent, began a supposedly temporary position at Trinity Church in New York. He eventually left Advent and worked for Trinity permanently from the first Sunday in November of the same year. He remained there for six years. Cutler, enthused by the arrangement with Trinity, was determined to organize and train the choir preparatory to vesting and placing in the chancel. By September of the following year, several changes had occurred at

15Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 270.
16The Parish of the Advent, 127-128.
17Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 270.
19Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 111.
20Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272.
Trinity. The choir was established in the chancel, however still in secular dress, and the psalms that were chanted routinely, as a part of the services were now choral. On Saints' days the Morning Prayer and AnteCommunion were fully choral, usually with full choir. The music, which gave proof of the progress made under Cutler's direction, consisted of ten Morning Prayer Services, two Communion Services and fifteen Anthems that were sung during the year. Three of the ten Services were new and two of these three new Services were written by Cutler. Half of the Anthems were solo Anthems and were more than likely all new, although composers' names are not given. Cutler also dismissed all the women of the choir, leaving men and boys only. There were, as usual, those who expressed a good deal of opposition to all the changes, but with the support of the rector and others of the vestry, the changes did take place.

After Cutler became firmly established at Trinity he was able to develop a most impressive choir that set an example for other newly organized boy choirs. In 1859 a group of sixteen choir boys and four men from St. Andrew's church in Providence, Rhode Island, a church where Cutler would later be employed, came to visit Trinity. A highlight of their two-day visit was a concert given by Trinity choir under the direction of Cutler. The rector

21Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 80
22Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272.
23Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 80.
24Ramussen, Musical Taste, 267.
of St. Andrew's at the time was the Reverend Daniel Henshaw. His choir had recently been formed and was still at an elementary stage of training.25

No one prior to Cutler seems to have developed the higher head tones in the first half of the nineteenth-century.26 His training in England helped him show the church-going public in the U.S. that the voices of boys were the most acceptable. Indeed, the editors of the Church Journal reported Trinity Church choir's performance at the 1859 gathering as "pleasurable". They added, "The chanting, considering the three ideals of spirit, distinctness, and volume, was the best we've ever heard".27 Cutler introduced many exceptional soloists and conducted prominent personalities, such as the Reverend J.H.Knowles, who served as a member of Trinity choir while studying at the General Theological Seminary in New York.28

On October 18, 1860 Cutler's choir at Trinity was given the honor of performing for the Prince of Wales who later became King Edward VII.29 During this period it was not proper to present a service before a high-ranking British official without surplices. Cutler then vested his choir in the same manner as those in the

---

25Ramussen, Musical Taste, 368.


27Quoted in Ramussen, Musical Taste, 369.

28Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 268-269.

29Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272.
English churches. As a result of this, other church officials and musicians vested their choirs and the idea became standard practice for the choir within the Episcopal church.

Cutler, on this occasion was also able to perform one of his original works. The Te Deum and the Benedictus from the Morning Prayer Office, recognized as simply Cutler in E Flat, were chanted with organ accompaniment. This gave Cutler the status of a highly esteemed choirmaster.

On October 16, 1861 a Choir Festival was held at Trinity Church. Five choirs of men and boys from New York, Jersey City, Hoboken, St. George’s in Flushing, and St. Andrew’s participated in this festival. Cutler was instrumental in organizing this "Union of Choirs" with Trinity as host and him as organist and choirmaster. Even one of his anthems, Who Can Express, was performed by Trinity choir during this festival. Standard Anglican music was also performed, and the event was favorably accepted by the Trinity church community, resulting in many requests for other "unions".

Another event that resulted from Cutler’s work occurred late

---

30 Ibid.
31 The New York Times, December 6, 1902, Death List of a Day. This obituary of Cutler states "H.S. Cutler ... credited with introducing vested male choirs in this country.
32 The New York Times, October 18, 1860, Prince Visits Trinity Church.
33 Ellinwood, The History of American Church Music, 77.
34 Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 89-90.
in 1864. Then, a chancel organ was installed at Trinity after the vestry became convinced of the difficulty of accompanying the choir with the gallery organ.35

An Article in The New York Times, "The Grand Choral Festival at Trinity Church, December, 1864", describes a three day festival celebration in honor of the "new chancel organ".36 The festival was under the direction of Cutler. He accompanied the choir on the organ. He also performed an original "Fantasia" during this festival to the theme of "We Three Kings of Orient Are".37 Only two concerts were originally intended during this festival, but, due to the large response of the public, the program of performances was extended.38

At this point, Cutler was at the height of his career with many accomplishments behind him. He received a Doctor of Music degree in 1864 from Columbia College in New York. This was only the third time this degree had been conferred in the United States.39 Dr. Cutler seemed to have proven himself within Trinity as a valuable resource. However, his work at Trinity finished with

35Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272. Mathews dates this organ installation 1865, probably because the organ was used regularly after its inaugural festival. See footnote 36.


37Ibid.

38Ibid.

39Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272.
an abrupt dismissal in 1865 for neglect of duty.\textsuperscript{40} In May of that year, Dr. Cutler began a concert tour and had taken several of the church staff with him, and this is the apparent cause of the termination of his position by the vestry with the consent of the rector "for absence without leave".\textsuperscript{41}

It seems rather severe that Cutler would be dismissed so casually from his position, especially after his years of demanding service. Cutler had contributed and performed a considerable amount of original music while at Trinity. He had reportedly composed seven Services and twenty-two anthems which were incorporated into Trinity's repertoire. His music had been used more than that by any other during his years at Trinity.\textsuperscript{42} Besides this, Cutler had contributed much time to the church, and the concerts in which he had been involved brought in a great deal of money.\textsuperscript{43} Through his guidance, Trinity's choir had become a model for innovations for other churches in New York and the Northeast.\textsuperscript{44}

Still, even with all this success, Cutler was dismissed. Perhaps the expression of open prejudices and envy from other churches in the city and their urging to turn away from such trendy


\textsuperscript{41}Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 109-110.

\textsuperscript{42}Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 91, 111.

\textsuperscript{43}Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 110.

\textsuperscript{44}Ramussen, Musical Taste, 367.
ideas as choir concerts, and devote more resources to worship could be partly behind the vestry's decision. Even in consequence of such an unfavorable decision, Cutler was not hindered from continuing his career. He then took charge of the music at Christ Church in New York. Later, he was permanently employed there as organist and choirmaster, as advertised on the cover of his published work *The Offertory Sentences*. This page is shown in Figure Three.

---

**THE OFFERTORY SENTENCES.**

**MUSIC**

Composed by

Dr. Henry Stephen Cutler.

---

*The New York Times*, December 22, 1864, Consecration of the Church of the Holy Trinity. "Right Reverend Potter" in a sermon for the consecration of the Church of the Holy Trinity disapproved of some churches' actions and spoke against "the necessity of conducting the service of the church in a manner to impress the worshipper". "The duty of the church, he said, was to preach the gospel." He then referred to the character of the music introduced into some churches (perhaps Trinity) which he thought lent no spirit of devotion to the worshipper, and was neither congregational nor in harmony with the service of the church.

*Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America*, 272.

*Henry Stephen Cutler, The Offertory Sentences*, (Boston: Oliver Ditson and Company; 1876), cover. Figure Three provides evidence of Cutler's full-time employment.
Cutler served at several other churches as visiting organist while employed at Christ Church. These churches included Trinity Church in Princeton, St. Mark’s Church in Orange, New Jersey, and St. Stephen’s Church in Providence, Rhode Island. Other churches where Cutler was employed included St. Ann’s Church in Brooklyn, New York, St. Mark’s Church in Philadelphia, Zion Church in New York City, and St. Paul’s Church in Troy, New York.

It is hard to determine the order in which Cutler was employed at these churches or what he accomplished at them, because not all of them have kept a complete recorded history. Two of these churches, however, that do have accounts of contemporaneous events that could very well reveal the activity of Cutler, although not specifically stated, are St. Stephen’s and Zion.

St. Stephen’s Church history has record of a Henry Carter as coming from Trinity in Boston from 1866. This Carter is claimed to be noted for organizing a boy choir, directing choir performances of eighteenth-century English church music, and using the English Psalter. It seems obvious that this Henry Carter was Henry Cutler, especially since Cutler was known for his work in these areas and was employed as visiting organist for St. Stephen’s

---

48Figure Three: Cutler, The Offertory Sentences, The cover documents these locations.

49Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272.

50This information is documented in a letter to this author from John E. Dick, Secretary of the Corporation, St. Stephen’s Church, dated July 6, 1994. It is not uncommon to find names misspelled during the eighteenth-century.
Church around that time.\textsuperscript{51}

Zion Church history in 1868 has a record of an organist who was appointed by the rector and with his consent began a vested choir of men and boys. This authority was none other than the Reverend Horatio Southgate, a former rector over Cutler and advocate of the English style of service. Southgate could have employed Cutler a second time for the very purpose of installing a boy choir in Zion Church, as he had done years before at the Advent Church in Boston, thereby correcting certain retention problems he was experiencing with his congregation during his rectorate at Zion.\textsuperscript{52} Cutler's last position of employment was at St. Paul's in Troy, New York.\textsuperscript{53} After his retirement he moved back to Boston. He died in Swampscott, Massachusetts on December 5, 1902.\textsuperscript{54}

As stated before information about Cutler has not been preserved by all the churches he reportedly worked for. His career

\textsuperscript{51}Cutler, The Offertory Sentences, cover, (See Figure Three).

\textsuperscript{52}David Clarkson, History of the Church of Zion and St. Timothy of New York, (New York and London: G.P. Putnam's Sons; 1894), 143.

\textsuperscript{53}Matthews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272.

\textsuperscript{54}The New York Times, December 6, 1902, Death List of a Day.
zenith was his employment at Trinity which produced beneficial effects. The lasting results of these effects and of his administration at Trinity were laying the foundation for the acceptance of vested choirs and instating the choral service as the normal and proper musical complement to the Divine Offices.55

Cutler composed only church music as far as is known. His writing style reflected his familiarity with English cathedral music which became his trademark. It is uncertain what the extent of his study of harmony and composition was, because his biographer reports only that he studied piano and violin.56 His work was well received by the individual churches where he was employed, especially Trinity Church. His Services and Anthems were considered comparable to the best English counterparts.57 He remained true to his method throughout his career and directly helped shape the Oxford movement in the United States.58

Cutler’s works include different types of services, anthems, and organ music. Mathews itemizes thirty-four anthems, which are compiled in his Trinity Anthems or Psalms of David (1865), nine services, a cantata on Psalm 107, twenty organ works which include three andantes, three variations, sarabande, toccata, six fugues,

55Messiter, Trinity Church, New York, 110
56Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 270.
57Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 263.
58Ellinwood, The History of American Church Music, 76-86.
and three canons. He also composed the Trinity Psalter published in 1864, which he modeled after the Advent Psalter, and a number of hymns. In 1871 Cutler composed ALL SAINTS, also named ALL SAINTS NEW, to which Harry Emerson Fosdick's "The Prince of Peace His Banner Spread", and Bishop Reginald Heber's "The Son of God Goes Forth to War", were set. He also composed "Brightest and Best of the Sons of Morning".  

Even though Cutler composed a large volume of music, much of it is lost. Two organ works ascribed to Cutler by Barbara Owen can be found in her publication A Century of American Organ Music 1776-1876. The first piece, retitled "Festival"Voluntary, is one of the original works published in 1852 by A.N. Johnson included in American Church Organ Voluntaries. The complete score appears as Figure Four.

This work is regarded as harmonically simple. Its melody is rather plain, but its continuous rhythm is somewhat lively. It is also a little more chromatic than the average eighteenth century English voluntary. Even though there is nothing complicated in the

59 Mathews, A Hundred Years of Music in America, 272.
61 H.S. Cutler and A.N. Johnson, American Church Organ Voluntaries, (New York: S.T. Gordon; 1852; Published in facsimile by The Organ Historical Society; 1987), 72. The voluntary in its original publication was not titled Festival Voluntary but was stated to be "for festival occasions". The works in this publication are not accredited to their authors unless they were foreign composers. This makes it difficult to know whether these other pieces were composed by Cutler and Johnson together or separately.
FESTIVAL VOLUNTARY

CUTLER & JOHNSON'S
American Church Organ Voluntaries, 1856
Edited by Barbara Owen

Figure Four (part one)
construction of this voluntary, it does give us an idea of the type of ecclesiastical music church-goers experienced during this period and of Cutler's ability when still a young composer. The second work by Cutler compiled in Owen's collection, is one of his three reported andantes, *Andante No. 2*. This is a lengthy organ work with more contrapuntal quality than the voluntaries. Its first page comprises Figure Five. It is representative of many organ works after the middle of the nineteenth-century that were hastily written because of a great demand for this particular type of music, making even some works of great composers poor in quality.

---

62 Stephen L. Pinel, Archivist, Organ Historical Society in the Forward of Cutler and Johnson, *American Church Organ Voluntaries*. This collection contains opening and closing voluntaries that were originally intended as a tool for amateur organists who had not yet mastered the skill of improvisation but had training in sightreading. (See section by Stopp in the same edition).

ANDANTE No. 2

HENRY STEPHEN CUTLER (1825-1902)
Edited by Barbara Owen

\( \text{\textit{Figure Five}} \)

\( j = 116 \)

Man. I

\[ \begin{array}{c}
\text{\textit{Flutes}} \\
\end{array} \]

Man. II

\[ \begin{array}{c}
\end{array} \]
The Trinity Anthems were published in 1865. These anthems were all composed by Cutler on texts appropriate to the Sundays in Lent and Advent, for Christmas Day and Epiphany. Cutler's terminology for naming his anthems is borrowed from the English tradition, however, his use of it differs from common practice. The anthems designated by Cutler as full anthem deviate from the norm of unrelieved choral singing. They, instead, have organ interludes inserted. What Cutler designates as solo anthem is properly known as verse anthem and what he designates as verse anthems are actually full anthems with verse.\(^6^4\)

Anthem number three "The Lord Will Come" was composed for the third Sunday in Advent, and is a full anthem. It begins with a full choir in four-part harmony and continues until measure twelve. Here, the tenor enters alone followed by the alto for two measures—fugal in character—then the music resolves into imitation with the soprano and bass added and continues in four-part harmony. Measures thirty-seven through forty-four are in unison, and the anthem ends in four-part harmony. Cutler achieves variety through changes in texture and chordal color. The melody is not elaborate, probably to maintain the simplicity of the style Cutler wanted to instill. It is shown in Figure Six.

No. 8.

The Lord will come.

FILL ANTHEM.

Composed by Dr. H. G. OCKLER. For the Third Sunday in Advent.
Figure Six (part Two)

The Lord will come and will bring to light... the hidden things of darkness...

will bring to light... the hidden things of darkness...
Figure Six (part three)

The Lord will come

of... the heart

The Lord will come

of... the heart

The Lord will come

The Lord will come and will bring to light the hidden things of

and then shall every man have praise of God.

darkness and then shall every man have praise of God.
Another anthem by Cutler, number eight, "Turn Ye Even Unto Me", shown in Figure Seven, is a solo anthem for Ash Wednesday. It begins with an alto solo until measure fourteen, then a bass solo enters and continues in duet with the alto until measure twenty-three. An organ interlude then occurs, followed by full chorus in unison until measure forty-two. Here four-part harmony is added that continues to the end.

Figure Seven (part one)
Figure Seven (part two)
Figure Seven (part three)
Two other works by Cutler that are shown in Figures Eight and Nine are examples from The Offertory Sentences, which are not listed by Mathews by title.

Figure Eight

The Offertory Sentences

If we have sown up to you spiritual things is it great

matter if we shall reap your worldly things?
Figure Nine

The Offertory Sentences

Do ye not know that they who minister about holy things live of the sacrifice, and they who wait at the altar are partakers with the altar?

Know also both the Lord also ordained that they who preach the
Finally an example from the Trinity Psalter, Shown here in Figure Ten, shows Cutler's Anglican- chant style of composition.

Figure Ten

THE PSALTER.

PSALM 133. Ecce, quam bonum!

BEHOLD how good and joyful a thing it is: brethren to dwell together in unity.

2 It is like the precious ointment upon the head that ran down unto the beard: even unto Aaron's beard and went down to the skirts of his clothing.

3 Like as the dew of Hermon: which fell upon the hill of Sion.

4 For there the Lord promised his blessing: and life for ever more.

The examples by Cutler that have been featured in this paper are simplistic in style but laced with chromaticism. Whether or not
this music represents his true artistic capacity is an issue that extends beyond the scope of this paper. As to his music's marketability, on the other hand, a discussion about Cutler found in The Anthem in England and America states, "significant as Cutler may have been to the individual churches in which he worked it is easy to see that he could not have won a share of the emerging octave publication market." However, Cutler's competitors did not limit their output to church pieces, rather they showed the skill that goes with a full education in art. Cutler may not be considered a great composer, but his contributions to American church choir practices hold much merit.

Cutler at the end of his life had succeeded with the goal that he was inspired to implant in this country. His influence has endured. He had promoted and trained all-male choirs and had instilled in congregations an appreciation not only for their choristers' sound but also their appearance. Perhaps it is he who speaks in an interview from the New York Times October 11, 1885, which more than any other report demonstrates the degree to which this style had become a veritable Episcopal-Church campaign. This interview is attached as Appendix I. By its time, 1885, Cutler, as stated before, was at the end of his career and still making important contributions to Episcopal Church History as well as American History.

---

65Elwyn A. Wienandt and Robert H. Young, The Anthem in England and America, 328.

66Ibid.
Appendix I
MALE CHOIRS IN FASHION

A Popular Innovation in Church Music.

The return of Autumn is the signal periodically, of renewed activity in the various departments of city life. Socially, educationally, dramatically; in trade and profession a new impetus prevails. Nor is the religious world different in this respect; Pastors and people have returned from long vacations, some of them having wandered across the sea, and they assemble again with fresh power and added zeal. In religious matters church music has come to sustain a separate and important existence. Next to its pastor city congregations esteem their choirs, and it might be whispered that in some instances the organ loft precedes the pulpit. At this season the choirmaster is particularly occupied in the preparation of the year's program, which, if he be the head of a Roman Catholic or protestant Episcopal Church choir, he finds no easy matter.

"It's in the air," said the organist and choirmaster of a prominent up-town church recently, "this male choir business. St. Ann's in Brooklyn is the latest to fall into line, but there are a half dozen congregations which will begin this Fall their first experience in the chorus choir of male voices."

"There has been a prejudice against them?" suggested a Times reporter.

"Undoubtedly," was the reply, "but it is slowly disappearing. It is more the concession granted, the precedent established, as it were, which may lead to further and undesirable innovation, that has created the feeling against male choirs rather than the thing
per se. The chorus of male voices belongs proper to the service of the Church of England. It is an ignorant error to point to it as being High Church, leaning toward Romanism, and that sort of thing. Old Trinity, for instance, is a pure example of the Established Protestant Episcopal Church, neither High nor Low, but simply adhering to the ritual for church service as laid down in the Book of Common Prayer; yet Trinity has the finest male choir in the city.

"But," the Professor continued, "its choir sings only the music that properly belongs to the English Church. At the Church of St. Mary the Virgin, however, the mass and special ceremonial music of the Roman Catholic Church is sung, but that church is an extremist quite to the verge of Romanism. Except for the exaltation of the Virgin Mary there seems so slender a line of demarkation between its services and those witnessed in any of the Romish churches in the city as to be scarcely perceptible. The Rector's title is "Father," incense is burned, the host elevated, the various processionals and recessionals gone through with., and the confessional even exists, although it is not obligatory."

"And is all this poplar?" asked the reporter. "In one way, at least. The church edifice is crowded at all its services. On the great festival days of the year- Easter, Christmas, etc.- the rush for seats is so pronounced that tickets have to be issued so as to allow persons who really have a right there to be accommodated - the friends of the members of the congregation, I mean, and such as would come before the public at large. It is well nigh impossible,
even at the ordinary services, to get a seat without knowing somebody there. Many, however, regard it as a hybrid sort of service, neither one thing nor the other, and there is no doubt that a large number who seek the place do so purely as a matter of curiosity, to hear the fine music and witness the peculiar service, because it is performed in a Protestant church. That this sort of service is not in growing favor may be assumed from the fact that St. Albans Church, of similar form of worship, which existed a few years ago, attracting equal attention, has been done away with, merged, I believe, into and with St. Mary's, unable either of them to stand by itself. To my mind, "added the Professor heartily, "there is nothing more devotional and sacred, more dignified and beautiful, than the pure Church of England form of worship as practiced in Trinity Parish."

"You indorse, I concluded, the male choir?" said the reporter after a pause.

"Yes, indeed," replied the Professor. "I conduct one, you know. There is something in a boy's voice that seems particularly suited to religious music, although," with a laugh, "the boy character has never been regarded as especially devotional. A boy's voice before it changes, "he continued, "is a woman's to all intents and purposes - a clear, high soprano, but it exists in head tones, and is only susceptible of a limited development until in fact the youthful voice changes to the deep and heavy notes of the man."

"It must be trying to train a boy to good work and then
suddenly find his voice gone," suggested the reporter.

"Oh, the transition is slow, and when he is absolutely useless in the treble we drop him into the alto, unless indeed we discover the existence of a tenor voice."

"Do you find plenty of voices?"

"Plenty of boys we find," replied the Professor," but the voices are not so numerous. I have been busy lately examining voices to start a choir for a church. It is most tiresome. You can never tell what to expect when the raw material presents itself, but in each case must persevere in the test. The other day a lad of 12 came to me; green, awkward - of the usual sort, you know.

"Can you sing?" I asked.

"Yes."

"Where have your ever sung?"

"Nowhere."

"Where did you learn to sing?"

"To home."

"Sound "A," I said, striking the note.

"He flatted horribly."

"Can you sing any sort of church music?" I then asked.

"Yes."

"What?"

"Holy, holy."

"Stand there, then, in front of me and sing it."

"He obeyed and charmed me. He had a beautiful voice. The
registers were as clear and well defined as in one matured and
developed. I took him on the spot, and he is a valuable
acquisition."

"What is the pay of the choir boy's"

"It varies according to the number of services and the fund
allowed the choirmaster. In a church up town, where the male choir
is an innovation, and as yet is only used for the Sunday afternoon
service, the pay is only a dollar a month. Many pay from $6 to
$10. Old Trinity picks with great fastidiousness, and will pay $40
if it cannot get the voice it wants for less."

"What class contributes mostly to these choirs?"

"Any and all, almost. Often sons of members of the
congregation have suitable voices, of boys in the neighborhood; it
makes no difference where they come from if they can sing. For my
own part, I don't want the church members' sons; they are apt to
fancy themselves somewhat more privileged than outsiders. It is a
difficult thing in many instances to manage a boy choir. You see
the pay is not, as a general thing, sufficient to prove any very
great attraction, and after the novelty wears off it is frequently
hard to keep them in regular attendance. Many of them resent, too,
the sharp training which alone can insure perfection. Altogether,
the lot of the choirmaster is not quite a happy one, if he is
faithful and successful."

"These male choirs so away, I suppose, with the quartet
choirs?" said the reporter.

"Usually, Yes; and that, by the way, is a great relief to the
choirmaster. The most refractory boy choir does not compare with the ordinary quartet of the organ loft, and if there is in addition a chorus, you may expect to see a wrinkled and careworn director. It is curious," the Professor went on, "how the possession of a voice inflates its owner with a sense of his own importance. It is an old story - the difficulties of an operatic impresario to preserve the harmony of his troupe- and, similarly, the director of church choirs walks a thorny path among his singers. There are always jealousies and dissensions in a chorus choir, and in a quartet the situation is worse. The soprano and alto ladies are most tenacious of their rights, real and fancied, and a work of praise to one must be balanced at once to the other. They must have their solos evenly distributed or there is a row immediately, and I have had singers where I have even had to alternate in handing the one or the other out of the organ loft."

"The men are different, I suppose," suggested the reporter.

"Only in kind," said the Professor emphatically. "They don't quarrel over my gallantry, but they are as keen over opportunities to display their voices as the women. As for a tenor, Bah! I don't believe the average tenor is a man at all - a mincing, consequential little puppet. I can't abide tenors, as such."

"Evidently the lovely Christian spirit does not penetrate the organ loft," laughed the reporter. "

"It does not, indeed," was the emphatic response. "The congregation would be amazed to see behind the curtains between the hymns. Laughing and chatting, writing notes, etc., is mild work
for most paid choirs. In one Presbyterian church up town not long ago the alto during the sermon invariably withdrew to a little room back of the organ and, producing her pack of cards, played solitaire steadily till needed for the closing hymn. I have often thought how scandalized that good old orthodox divine would have been if while she was so laboriously and conscientiously sowing the seed she could have suddenly noted the very thorny ground upon which some of it was falling. I had at one time a pretty Jewess in my choir who sang delightfully but who swore abominably. She could curse like a pirate and I had finally to let her go an account of her profanity. But you will have to excuse me," concluded the Professor, "I have promised a tenor a hearing today, one by the way with whom I lately appointed a meeting between 5 and 6 o'clock pm. He returned the reply that he could not be on hand at that time as it was his hour for dining. This from a fellow who has been importuning me for a place for months. But then he is a tenor, what can you expect! Bah!"

Cutler, Henry Stephen and Johnson, Artemus Nixon, *American Church Organ Voluntaries*, (New York: S.T. Gordon; 1852; Published in Facsimile by The Organ Historical Society; 1987).

Cutler, Henry Stephen, *The Offertory Sentences*, (Boston, Oliver Ditson and Company; 1876).

Dick, John E., Secretary of the corporation, St. Stephens's Church, (letter dated July 6, 1994).


The New York Times, December 6, 1902, "Death List of a Day".

The New York Times, December 24, 1964, "The Grand Choral Festival at Trinity Church".

The New York Times, October 18, 1960, "Prince Visits Trinity Church".


The Parish of the Advent in the City of Boston: *A History of One Hundred Years 1844-1944*, (Boston: Printed for the Parish of the Advent, 1944).

Pinel Stephen L., Archivist, Organ Historical Society in the Forward of Cutler and Johnson's *American Church Organ Voluntaries*, (New York: S.T. Gordon; 1852; Published in Facsimile by The Organ Historical Society; 1987).

